DERBYSHIRE AND DERBY

MINERALS LOCAL PLAN

Towards a Minerals Local Plan:

Spring 2018 Consultation

CHAPTER 7

7.1 Building Stone

December 2017

DERBYSHIRE County Council

Derby City Council

Introduction

7.1.1 The main source of building and roofing stone in the Plan Area is the sandstone/gritstone of Carboniferous origin. Limestone is also produced in small amounts for this purpose as a by-product at some of the limestone producing quarries. To be suitable for building purposes, stone has to be of a particular quality and character. Resources of good quality building stone are scarce. As with all minerals, it is a finite resource and can only be worked where it is found, meaning that the location of the quarries has to be restricted to certain areas.

7.1.2 The market for building stone is small but profitable and is concerned mainly with the repair and restoration of historic buildings or with the repair/extension of existing properties or new build properties and structures in areas of high environmental value, such as conservation areas where it is important to preserve and enhance local distinctiveness and local building character. It is, therefore, of great importance for the conservation of Derbyshire's historic and built environment.

7.1.3 The market for building stone fluctuates greatly, meaning future demand is very unpredictable. There are also wide variations in the character of the stone, which are critical to specific market needs. This increases the unpredictability of determining where stone will be extracted for specific projects over the Plan Period.

7.1.4 In the Plan Area, the majority of resources of building and roofing stone are in Derbyshire, often in areas of landscape which are close to the Peak District National Park and which may impact on the setting of the National Park. The need to protect the landscape will, therefore, be an important consideration in many proposals to work this resource.

Vision and Objectives

7.1.5 The Vision will help to define the direction of the Plan by stating where we want to be in terms of mineral development by the end of the Plan Period. It will set out what the Plan Area will be like in terms of mineral development in 2030 if the policies and proposals of the Plan have been delivered successfully over the Plan Period. The Objectives will set out how the Vision will be delivered and implemented. Further information on the Vision and Objectives can be found in Chapter 3.

The following objectives are relevant to this chapter:

Objective 1 - Ensuring a Steady and Adequate Supply of Minerals

Objective 2 - Delivering Sustainable Minerals Development

Objective 3 - Achieving the most Appropriate Spatial Distribution of Mineral Development

Objective 5 – Minimising Impacts on Communities

Objective 6 – Protecting the Natural and Built Environment

Objective 7 – Protecting the Peak District National Park

Objective 8 – Minimising Flood Risk and Climate Change

Evidence Base

7.1.6 Derbyshire County Council and Derby City Council obtained information on building stone from a variety of sources as a foundation for preparing the new Minerals Local Plan as a replacement for the adopted Derby and Derbyshire Minerals Local Plan, 2000. A summary of the information obtained is presented below.

Production and Demand

7.1.7 Through the 20th Century, natural stone was gradually substituted by other materials such as brick, clay, concrete, steel and glass, particularly in domestic housing. The main reason for this substitution is cost, particularly

the cost of dressing natural stone to the required size and shape for building. Bricks and concrete blocks are much easier to make; their production is highly mechanised and, as they are of a standard size and shape, building with them is easier, and cheaper, than with stone.

7.1.8 Since the 1970s, however, the use of locally sourced building and roofing stone has increased, becoming an increasingly important factor in the promotion of local identity and together with the desire to create a diversity of building forms with a wider range of materials in new housing, the national demand for traditional building materials has increased. The market for building stone is now relatively small but buoyant. There would appear to be no reason why this general trend will not continue throughout the period of the Minerals Local Plan.

Building Stone in Derbyshire

7.1.9 Three main groups of building stone have been exploited in Derbyshire.

- The Visean (Lower Carboniferous) Limestones were formed around 330 million years ago from an organic rich sediment, made up of the broken shells of millions of marine organisms that accumulated on the seabed in tropical or sub-tropical settings. This material is cemented together with natural calcium carbonate. The limestones are concentrated in the north western part of Derbyshire, mainly around Buxton and the Matlock/Wirksworth area.
- Namurian (Upper Carboniferous) sandstones were deposited by large rivers flowing into these shallow limey seas, forming large deltas around 320 million years ago. They are known as Millstone Grit or gritstone where it is coarse grained, and are located in the north western parts of the county. Finer grained sandstones of the same age are found in eastern parts of the county, in association with the Pennine Coal Measures. This resource is concentrated in the central part of the county between Derby and Chesterfield and in the north west of the county around Glossop. There is also a small outcrop which has been worked recently near Hardwick Hall.

7.1.10 In essence, the Visean Limestones are structurally complicated, but also massive, whereas Namurian sandstones (the Millstone Grits) are a generally thinner and more uniformly bedded stone.

- The Cadeby (Permian) Limestone outcrop on the eastern side of the county was also an important source of building stone. This was deposited around 250 million years ago.

7.1.11 All these stones and less significant local types have been used in Derbyshire for centuries and their particular characteristics have influenced strongly the pattern of traditional building.

7.1.12 The most important attributes of a good building stone are hardness, durability and porosity. The two most common building stone rocks in Derbyshire, as described above; sandstone and limestone, are composed mainly of the minerals quartz and calcite respectively, whose contrasting properties affect the character of the whole rock.

7.1.13 The main sedimentary building stones in Derbyshire have undergone lithification, which involves the closure of voids by compaction during burial, combined with their infill by natural mineral cements. This process makes the rocks extremely tough and less porous.

7.1.14 The geology of the sandstones and limestones often creates landscapes which are rich in environmental, historical and ecological diversity. The need to protect the landscape will therefore be a significant consideration on any new proposals for working these reserves and should be balanced against the need for the material. In practice, compared with aggregate extraction, operations to extract stone for building purposes are often small in scale with modest production levels, enabling their impact to be minimised.

Current Planning Permissions

7.1.15 In the Plan area, four quarries have valid permissions to produce stone specifically for building purposes. Larger quarries, producing mainly aggregate as their principal product, also produce some quantities of building stone to order, as an ancillary product. In 2015, the quarries produced around 30,000 tonnes of building stone. Production has been variable over the last few years, possibly as a result of specific orders for large scale projects. In 2016, there was no production from the building stone quarries but over 170,000 tonnes was produced from larger hard rock quarries.

7.1.16 A combination of architectural or market preferences and technical processing requirements has resulted in a distinct focus upon consistently medium to fine grained stone, available in very thick beds lacking any form of imperfection or weakness. In terms of colour, there is generally a strong desire (subject of course to any detailed matching criteria), for buff/light brown, or peach, pink or lilac tints. Where possible stone which cuts easily when fresh but hardens with exposure is sought after.

7.1.17 Further more detailed information regarding building stone in Derbyshire is available in the following background paper.

Towards a Minerals Local Plan: Spring 2018 Consultation

Building Stone Background Paper, December 2017

National Planning Policy Framework (NPPF)

7.1.18 In general terms, the NPPF states that, 'Minerals are essential to support sustainable economic growth and our quality of life. It is therefore important that there is a sufficient supply of material to provide the infrastructure, buildings, energy and goods that the country needs. However, since minerals

are a finite natural resource and can only be worked where they are found, it is important to make best use of them to secure their long-term conservation'.

7.1.19 NPPF policy states that when preparing local plans, local planning authorities should identify and include policies for the extraction of mineral resources of local and national importance in their area. Building stone is a resource of local and some national importance as a result of importance in maintaining heritage assets and local distinctiveness. It also states that local plans should set out environmental criteria, in line with policies in the Framework, against which planning applications will be assessed, so as to ensure that permitted operations do not have unacceptable adverse impacts on the natural and historic environment and other aspects.

7.1.20 At paragraph 144, it states that local planning authorities should consider how to meet demand for small scale extraction of building stone at or close to relic quarries needed for the repair of heritage assets and to recognise the mainly small scale, intermittent nature and impact of building and roofing stone quarries.

7.1.21 Section 12 of the NPPF sets out the national policy approach to the conservation and enhancement of the historic environment, referring to the treatment of historic buildings and the wider historic environment and the wide range of social, economic and environmental benefits that the conservation and enhancement of the historic environment can bring. It recognises that new development within historic areas can make a positive contribution to the area.

National Planning Practice Guidance

7.1.22 The National Planning Practice Guidance (NPPG) and contains planning policy and practice guidance on a wide range of planning issues, including planning for the extraction of minerals. It acknowledges that minerals are a finite resource with restricted availability, such that locations where they are economically viable and where extraction would be environmentally acceptable may be limited. It also repeats the statement in the NPPF that minerals make an essential contribution to the country’s prosperity and quality of life.

Strategic Stone Study

7.1.23 The Study is led by Historic England (formerly English Heritage), working with the British Geological Survey and local geologists and historic buildings experts. It covers 35 counties in England. For each county, using a combination of fieldwork and historic records and maps, a representative range of historic structures, from castles and cathedrals to houses and cottages, boundary walls, roofs, bridges, kerbs and paving, has been selected and the types of stones used, identified. This has enabled the most significant building stones in each county to be established and, where possible, the original source of stone for a particular building or settlement was identified. In addition, the location of all quarries that produced these stones has been mapped, so that potential sources for conservation and new build can be recognised and safeguarded. This information is published on the British Geological Survey website.[1]

Consultations Undertaken and Comments Received

7.1.24 The development of the new Minerals Local Plan has included a series of consultations to ascertain the views of relevant local authorities, organisations and bodies with an interest in mineral development and the potential implications of mineral development and the people of Derbyshire and their representatives.

Stakeholder Workshops 2009

7.1.25 In July 2009, Derbyshire County and Derby City Councils held a workshop for key stakeholders. This helped to identify the key issues and themes that people thought the new Minerals Local Plan should address and sought the input of stakeholders in developing the vision and objectives for the Plan. The outcomes of the workshop were published on the Council's website and in a newsletter that was circulated to stakeholders.

7.1.26 These comments were taken into account in the preparation of the Issues and Options Report.

[1] http://mapapps.bgs.ac.uk/buildingStone/BuildingStone.html

Issues and Options 2010

7.1.27 At the Issues and Options stage in 2010, we asked you whether we should identify specific quarries or devise a general policy against which to assess all proposals.

7.1.28 There was more support expressed for a criterion based, rather than a site specific, policy, but this was not unanimous. There was also support for a combination of the two options. The sustainability appraisal (see below) also provided no clear direction regarding this issue.

7.1.29 As a result of the responses to the Issues and Options Paper giving no clear steer regarding this issue, and taking account also of the conclusions of the sustainability appraisal, we suggested at that time (as reported in the Analysis of Responses to the Issues and Options Paper, 2011) that specific quarries could be allocated to ensure that specific conservation projects have sufficient stone to meet future needs and that a general criteria based policy would enable other proposals to be assessed as they came forward.

7.1.30 However, since that time, we have had more detailed discussions with experts at English Heritage and the National Stone Centre regarding the issue of building stone, in particular regarding the Strategic Stone Study referred to above, a joint project led by English Heritage with the British Geological Survey and Derbyshire County Council. This establishes the significant building stones that are used in historical buildings in each county and the potential quarries which could supply it.

7.1.31 It became clear through these discussions that the identification of specific sites for the working of building stone would, in reality, be highly problematic. This is because future proposals for building stone result from a specific conservation need and, as shown by the Strategic Stone Study, would therefore relate to a particular location and specification of material. Also, given the specific characteristics of building stone and the significant variation between localities, it is not considered practical or appropriate to identify sites.

It is worth noting also in this respect that operators had not at this time put any sites forward for building stone through the MLP.

7.1.32 In view of these factors, it was not considered a realistic option to make provision for the future working of building stone through the identification of specific sites. The issue with building/dimension stone is not so much *where* it is extracted but more to do with the *quality* of the mineral and the likely end market. For this reason, the Councils do not propose to restrict new building stone quarries geographically but to judge proposals on strict criteria on the quality of the stone, size of site/output and intended markets. As building stone workings are likely to be relatively small scale and limited in number, a criteria policy is considered to be the most appropriate and realistic approach to enable provision to be made for the working of this resource over the Plan period.

Towards a Minerals Local Plan – Rolling Consultation 2015/2016

7.1.33 The draft proposals set out in the Issues and Options exercise were prepared prior to the introduction of significant changes in international and national planning policy, notably the publication of the National Planning Policy Framework. Other emerging local policies and strategies and new evidence base were also considered to be important factors that should be taken into account in the formulation of the vision, objectives and policies for the new Plan, including the approach of the Plan to the provision of building stone.

7.1.34 Seven comments were received to the 2015/2016 rolling consultation in respect of the general approach that we should be taking. The main issues raised are:

- That the policy should not restrict levels of production to only small scale proposals and should also not restrict the amount of aggregate that is sold as a by-product.
- Disagree that it is not possible to predict the need for building stone
- That specific sites should be identified because this increases certainty.
- Comment has also been submitted which suggest a number of criteria that should be included in the policy and supporting text.

7.1.35 These have been considered and included, where appropriate, in Policy MS7 below.

Assessment of Comments and Outcomes for the Plan

7.1.36 Building stone quarries have always been relatively small scale and by their very nature often intermittent in their production. National policy also refers to the need for small scale building stone extraction. However, it is agreed that the policy could be more appropriately worded to be less restrictive. The emerging approach is not restricting the sales of aggregate per se but simply ensuring that building stone is the primary product, which seems entirely reasonable for a policy which is addressing future proposals for building stone. We are well aware that there will always be an element of sub-standard stone extracted from these quarries which will be used as aggregate.

7.1.37 There is little to be gained from attempting to predict the need for building stone. This is because future proposals for building stone result from a specific conservation need and, as shown by the Strategic Stone Study, would therefore relate to a particular location and specification of material. We consider, therefore, that a policy which assesses proposals for building stone as they are submitted would be the most pragmatic and realistic way of dealing with this issue.

7.1.38 Amendments made to policy as appropriate.

Hard Rock Consultation 2016/2017

7.1.39 An additional 12 week consultation was undertaken from December 2016 to February 2017 to consult on sites that had been suggested for hard rock extraction. This included a site that was put forward for building stone extraction at Bent Lane, Darley Dale (New Parish Quarry). An initial assessment of the site was undertaken using the Hard Rock Site Assessment Methodology and published for consultation at this time. A drop-in session

was also held at the Whitworth Centre in Darley Dale to allow local people to discuss this proposal with Council officers. 325 individuals and organisations commented on this proposal and 83 people attended the community drop-in session. A summary of the comments made and a response to them can be found in the following document:

Towards a Minerals Local Plan: Spring 2018 Consultation
Report of Representations and Responses, December 2017.

7.1.40 At the same time, a revised version of the draft strategy was again put out for consultation to take account of the fact that a site has been proposed for allocation.

Derby and Derbyshire Minerals Local Plan: Rolling Consultation, 2015/2016

Towards a Strategy for Building Stone, December 2016

7.1.41 People were given two options; the first asking if they thought this site should be allocated alongside a criteria policy to assess other sites that come forward or the second option, which asked if no sites should be allocated and to instead rely solely on a criteria policy for determining all sites that come forward. Although there were a significant number of responses to the proposed site at Bent Lane, as set out above, there were only four responses to this overall strategy; three supporting Option 2 and one supporting Option 1.

Assessment of Comments and Outcomes for the Plan

A. The Identification of Sites for Building Stone

7.1.42 The evidence base indicates that a variety of building stone resources are to be found in the Plan area and there is a local, and to some extent national, demand for some of those particular minerals. The Councils recognise that

the Mineral Products Association, in particular identifies more of a national need for the product.[2] However, the NPPF recognises the need for only small scale building stone extraction. We have weighed all considerations and, on balance, the Councils consider that specific sites should not be allocated in this Plan, for the following reasons:

i) There is no agreed national framework for assessing the future need for building stone. The Councils note the views of the Mineral Products Association in terms of there being a need to meet a national, as well as a local, need for building stone, but in the absence of any specific identified need and the fact that the NPPF refers to small scale need for building stone, the councils consider that there is insufficient certainty to justify the allocation of specific sites in this Plan.

ii) The Strategic Stone Study advises that the market for building stone fluctuates greatly, making future demand difficult to predict. Also, given the specific characteristics of building stone and the significant variation between localities, it is not considered practical or appropriate to identify specific sites unless a significant amount of work has been undertaken which proves that there is a need for a particular type of stone from a specific location.

iii) The majority of responses to the Plan throughout its preparation have supported the inclusion of a criteria policy for building stone provision rather than the allocation of specific sites.

7.1.43 In conclusion, therefore, as a result of these considerations, the Councils consider that, on balance, the most appropriate and pragmatic approach for this Plan will be to assess any sites that come forward during the course of the Plan period using a criteria policy as set out below. If further evidence comes forward during the course of the Plan Period to suggest that a different course of action is required, we can examine this as part of the ongoing monitoring and review of the Plan.

[2] Dimension Stone, An Essential UK Industry, 2015

B. New Parish Quarry

7.1.44 This site at Bent Lane, Darley Dale has been suggested as an allocation. There were a significant number of objections to this proposal from local people. However, the Councils maintain that, for the reasons set out above, it will not be appropriate to allocate sites for building stone in this Plan. As a result of this proposed approach, the Councils have not applied the site assessment methodology to this site.

7.1.45 For the reasons set out above, it is not considered to be practical to make a specific provision for future building stone extraction. Instead it is intended to maintain the approach of the existing adopted Minerals Local Plan to set out a criteria based policy to determine any proposals for building stone extraction that do come forward over the course of the Plan period.

Duty to Cooperate

7.1.46 National Planning Guidance sets out that in planning for minerals extraction, mineral planning authorities are expected to co-operate with other authorities on strategic matters.

7.1.47 The provision of building stone is considered to be a strategic matter by virtue of the fact that the market for the material involves significant cross boundary movements. We have liaised with and will continue to liaise with MPAs where surveys show that Derbyshire's building stone is sold and with other relevant stakeholders to help ensure that provision of building stone will be maintained at the necessary level to allow these movements to continue.

Sustainability Appraisal

7.1.48 The Sustainability Appraisal process is a way of testing the impact of the Plan against a series of Sustainability Objectives. Where the process recommends improvements to the Plan, these will be incorporated. A sustainability appraisal has been undertaken of all the Papers that constituted the Towards a Minerals Local Plan Rolling Consultation 2014-2017, including those concerning building stone. The appraisal reported as follows:

> Broadly speaking, the site proposed for option 1 would not generate significant negative effects on ecology. However, there may be potential to affect the connectivity of habitats, and locally important species. Though mitigation should be possible, a potential negative effect is recorded. For option 2, the effects depend on the location of sites.
>
> Option 1 provides greater certainty of a supply of minerals compared to option 2. It is possible to ascertain that positive effects would occur for option 1, but for option 2 there is greater uncertainty.
>
> Option 1 would provide greater certainty to meet specific needs to support the character of buildings and settlements in Derbyshire and beyond reliant on the types of building stone found in Derbyshire. Effects of this option could therefore secure benefits in terms of local distinctiveness in the County. However, the quarry itself could have negative effects on landscapes with historic environment. Therefore, mixed effects are recorded. Some of the building stone resources are located close to the Peak District National Park and therefore there is potential for extensions to existing sites and proposals coming forward under option 2 to have negative effects upon its setting. However promoting extensions to existing sites could also assist with securing restoration of existing sites. It is uncertain what the effects would be at this stage.
>
> As this is a new site (for option 1), access and exiting infrastructure does not exist. The export route could potentially have negative effects on local road networks. It is also possible that negative effects could occur on sites determined through a criteria-based policy, but there are uncertainties at this stage.
>
> A criteria based policy will seek to ensure that impacts on communities and health are minimised. However, the extent to which effects occurs is dependent upon the location of sites. For Option 1, there are some known issue that could occur with regards to dust, noise and visual amenity. Therefore negative impacts would be anticipated without mitigation. For option 2, the effects are uncertain.
>
> Both options could support the local economy by allowing for extraction of minerals. However, the effects for option 1 are more certain given that a site is identified.

The full appraisal is available in the following document.

The Proposed Approach

7.1.49 As it is known that building stone resources are present in the Plan area and in order to be able to determine the acceptability or otherwise of individual proposals that may come forward, it is proposed to include a criteria based policy.

7.1.50 The continued quarrying of local building stone plays an important role in helping to preserve the historic environment and enhancing the local distinctiveness of an area. Local stone is needed to enable existing historic buildings and structures to be repaired and restored effectively and it also means new buildings in historic areas can blend in with the surrounding area more effectively. The main reason for the quarry should be for the production of building stone but it is recognised that there will be a certain amount of stone which is not suitable for this purpose and which may be sold for aggregate or is deemed to be waste material and is used in the final restoration of the site. It will be important that the proposal is of a scale that respects the location where it is proposed and that any adverse impact on the surrounding area can be mitigated.

Policy MS7: The Provision of Building Stone

Proposals for new building stone quarries or extensions to existing ones will be permitted provided that:

- The extraction would be primarily for building stone rather than for aggregate.
- There is a need for mineral of a specific character to be worked in that particular location.
- The scale of the proposal is such that any adverse social and environmental impact could be mitigated satisfactorily.

Monitoring

7.1.51 As set out at in Chapter 3, the Plan will contain a number of objectives to be achieved over the Plan period, in order to achieve the Plan's overall Vision. The effectiveness of the Plan's polices and proposals, put in place to meet those objectives, will be monitored so that, if necessary, issues can be identified and addressed through a revision of the Plan, either in whole or part.

7.1.52 Policy MS7 of the Draft Plan sets out a series of criteria to allow sites for building stone to come forward as necessary. The effectiveness of these criteria will be monitored over the course of the Plan period through the consideration of how they have been used and implemented in planning applications for building stone. Further information on this issue can be found in Chapter 15 of the Plan.

Do you have any comments on the approach to ensuring the supply of building stone, as set out in this Chapter?